
Ridwan¹, Muhammad Yahya Abdullah²
¹Religious Training Center, Palembang, Indonesia
²UIN Raden Fatah, Palembang, Indonesia

The bibliometric study attempts to analyze a number of related literature documents in the field of religious moderation obtained from the Scopus database as a qualitative method approach. This research aims to look at the dynamics of the development of religious moderation research through reviewing the development of keywords, authors and journal publications related to this issue. Then the metadata taken from Scopus totaled 78 articles and was last updated on October 5 2023, analyzed with the help of the biblioshiny R application by focusing the analysis on three crucial things (keywords, authors and publication journals). The results of this research show that the dynamics of research in the field of religious moderation have not yet developed significantly, but this does not deny that religious moderation has been integrated quite a lot in other fields of study, apart from that there are also several recommendations for researchers to develop their research on the topic of moderate Islam, radicalism, Islamic moderation, moderation, politics, religion, religious moderation, tolerance and intolerance.

Keywords: Religious Moderation; Development; Bibliometric

Received: 7 November 2023
Accepted: 9 December 2023
Published: 31 December 2023

Citation:
INTRODUCTION

The concept of religious moderation has begun to be widely discussed in academic circles since 2019 was officially designated as the year of religious moderation by the Indonesian minister of religion (Malik et al., 2021), subsequently various research on the concept of religious moderation continues to develop widely at the national level (Harismawan et al., 2022; Sutrisno, 2019) and internationally (Hernawan et al., 2021; Pajarianto et al., 2022), then this indicates a dynamic development of research in the field of religious moderation.

The concept of religious moderation is proposed as a solution to ward off radicalism and terrorism in society in various forms of strategy, both in the fields of education (Sutrisno, 2019), da’wah (Aziz, 2019), social (Sulton, 2019), economic (Seputro, 2019) and several areas that are integrated as steps to implement the concept of religious moderation in real terms in Indonesian society.

Through this research, we will trace the dynamics of research development on the concept of religious moderation and what themes are widely discussed by researchers in the field of religious moderation through a bibliometric approach. So, it is hoped that it will be able to make scientific contributions to academics and regulators in this field to develop topics related to religious moderation.

We can explore several previous studies related to this research, such as an article written by Eko Harianto which discusses publication trends related to religious moderation in the 2020-2021 time period through bibliometric studies. In this research, data was obtained from Scopus and then analyzed using the BibExcel and Vosviewer applications (Harianto, 2022). A study written by Vivin Devi Prahesti who also analyzed research articles related to the concept of religious moderation from 2020 to 2022. These articles were taken from Google Scholar using the Publish or Perish application and then the articles were analyzed through the Vosviewer application (Prahesti, 2022).

The research presented in the seminar with related studies was also written by Arifah Nur Istitqomah and Busro (2023). The research aims to analyze articles with the keyword religious moderation in the dimension application with a publication year limit of 2003-2022. Next, these articles are analyzed bibliometrically with the help of the VosViewer application so that you can see annual trends (Istitqomah & Busro, 2023). Other research written by Riri Raudhotul Jannah and Busro is also relevant to the topic of this article. The article examines religious moderation in the digital era with research data taken from the dimension database, then analyzed using the VosViewer application to visualize the results of data analysis (Jannah & Busro, 2023).

The last research related to the topic in this topic is an article written by Subandi and Amirunnaufal. This research took data from the Scopus database and then analyzed with VosViewer application to find topics that could be used as research gaps for future researchers in the field of religious moderation (Subandi & Amirunnaufal, 2023).

Looking at several previous studies, this research has similarities in the approach used, namely the bibliometric approach, but what differentiates this research is the application that will be used to analyze data taken from the Scopus database. The application used is Bibioshiny R which has more and specific features compared to the VosViewer used by previous researchers. With the new data analysis software used, it will provide research study results that are comprehensive and distinctive from previous research.

METHOD

This research design uses a qualitative research with a bibliometric approach as a type of systematic literature review method (Fan et al., 2021; Mukherjee et al., 2022) to reveal trends that emerge in a number of articles and journals, collaboration patterns, and constituents. research, and to explore the intellectual structure of a particular domain in the relevant literature (Donthu et al., 2021; Moed et al., 1985). The data source for this research was taken from metadata originating from the Scopus database covering the years from 2009 to 2023 with the keyword "religious moderation". The data collection technique in this research uses the data mining method via the Scopus database which was accessed on October 5 2023 with a total of 78 documents related to the keyword "religious moderation". Meanwhile, the data analysis technique uses the help of the biblioshiny application to map metadata into conceptual maps (Chaudhari & Pawar, 2021; Ejaz et al., 2022; Thakuria et al., 2023). The data source for this research comes from the Scopus database which was updated on October 5 2023 with a total of 78 literature documents in metadata form consisting of four types of documents, namely 67 articles, 4 book chapters, 4 conference articles, and 3 reviews.
RESULTS AND ANALYSIS

The three fields plot is a concept map that illustrates three important elements as a result of analysis of metadata originating from Scopus. The three important elements consist of the name of the publication journal, author and topic. The three elements are linked with gray lines to each other. Furthermore, in each element there is a colored box, the older and longer the size of a box indicates that it has quite a significant quantity and has many connections connected to other elements.

The first element is located on the left, which consists of several journal publication names with a total of nine journals consisting of various types of publications such as scientific articles, conference articles, books and reviews. The journal that is most dominant and publishes the most articles related to religious moderation is the HTS Teologies studies/Theological Studies journal, indicated by the dark red color of the journal and the long box size. This journal is connected to two authors, namely Pribadi I. and Pajarianto H.

The second element, which is located between the other two elements, consists of 19 authors who are active in scientific studies on the topic of religious moderation with various types of articles sourced from several journals. By looking at the type of color and size of the box, we can say that there are three authors who are most connected to the topic elements located on the right (keywords/topics) are Hadiz VR with five topics, namely Indonesia, Islam, Democracy, Oligarchy and Politics, then Pajarianto and Pribadi I which are connected to five topics, namely Religious Moderation, tolerance, local wisdom, harmony and moderation. The last two authors are also related to the element located on the left, namely the HTS Teologies studies/Theological Studies journal, this shows that the two authors wrote an article with five related topics originating from that journal.

The last element located on the right is a collection of several keywords that are often used by writers in the field of religious moderation with a total of 16 words. The word that appears most often is the word religious moderation by looking at the size of the box and its color. The word religious moderation is connected with several writers in the elements located in the Middle, namely Pajarianto H, Pribadi I, Latifa R, Subchi I, Burhanuddin N, Yusuf M, Abdullah I, Kholil S, A’yun Q, Abdillah KY, Adelia P, Ahmad RRMR, A’la A.

Figure 1. Three-fields plot
Source Impact

Next are the results of the analysis which shows the impact of each journal that publishes articles related to the topic of religious moderation based on the h-index measurement, which can be seen clearly in Figure 2, an illustration that presents the impact of each journal which can be seen based on category. The color.

In the picture, there are 10 names of journals that publish documents related to the word religious moderation. The dark blue color shows that the journal has the highest h-index among other journals and is widely cited by other researchers, such as the journal HTS Teologiese Studies/ Theological Studies, Journal of Social Studies Education Research, Journal of Islamic Education, Moderate Voices In The European Reformation. Meanwhile, the other six journals in light blue only received an h-index score scale of one.

![Figure 1. Source Impact](image)

Tree and Thematic Map

The illustration in Figure 3 visualizes several words that often appear in several scientific articles related to religious moderation. The word that dominates the most at 25% is the word religious moderation with 35 repetitions. Furthermore, the second word that dominates at 7% is Indonesia with 10 repetitions of the word. And the third word that dominates at 6% is the word Indonesia. And the remaining 62% is dominated by other topics.

The thematic map in Figure 4 visualizes a conceptual map that has two core lines, namely the density line which is a vertical line on the left of the image, while the centrality line is a horizontal line extending at the bottom of the image. Each line shows its own meaning, the density line shows that topics that are close to the top line (density) indicate that the topic has been widely studied by researchers in the field of religious moderation, while topics that increasingly shift to the right indicate that the keyword has enough impact in research in the field of religious moderation. This conceptual map is also divided into four types of sections, namely Motor Themes, Basic themes, Niche Themes and Emerging or Declining Themes.

In the top right, which consists of the words "Indonesia, Islam and Interfaith Dialogue" is classified as a high-density and high-centrality topic. Next, at the top left, there are the words Quality of Education, Local Wisdom, Islamic Boarding School and Harmony which are classified as high density but low centrality
topics. However, the topic of quality of education has a higher density than other topics in the niche themes.

Figure 3. Three Map

Furthermore, in the bottom left topic there are three words, namely moderate Islam, radicalism and Islamic moderation which are classified as low density and low centrality topics. And finally, the topics located at the bottom right, namely moderation, politics, religion, religious moderation, tolerance and intolerance are classified as topics with high centrality, but low density. And the green topics in basic themes have a higher density than the topics in red.

Figure 4. Thematic Map

With an explanation of the research results above regarding the topic of religious moderation with data sources taken from Scopus literature. With a range from 2009 – 2023 which is around 14 years to
see how the field of religious moderation has developed and what topics are discussed in it. Based on the data above, it can be seen that the topic of religious moderation studies has developed from year to year over a period of fourteen years as indicated by the number of published journals, authors, and topics studied in this field. We can see these three elements clearly in Figure 1, namely in the visualization of the three fields plot which presents the relationship between these three elements, and we can also see the journal and author's name which have the highest and lowest intensity in each element, so we can see the journal and the most productive writers, as well as what topics are most studied by these researchers.

The HTS Teologise Studies/Theological Studies Journal and the Islamic Education Journal (Jurnal Pendidikan Islam) are the most productive journals based on the h-index scale based on Figure 2. These two journals are also journals that are widely connected with the names of researchers in various types of study topics in the field of religious moderation as stated This can be clearly seen in Figure 1, but the HTS Teologise Studies/Theological Studies journal can be considered the most productive and impactful journal by looking at Figures 1 and 2.

The topic that appears most frequently related to the concept of religious moderation in various articles is the topic of "religious moderation". This shows that the discussion of the topic of the concept of religious moderation has not developed massively if it is integrated into other study topics. This can be seen by the topic "religious moderation" still dominating as much as a quarter percent of one hundred percent of the words.

Even though the development of the concept of religious moderation has not developed significantly, it cannot be denied that the concept of religious moderation has also been integrated in various other study topic areas, such as tolerance, Islam, Islamic moderation, politics, interfaith dialogue, local wisdom and several other study topics. However, interestingly, there is the topic "Indonesia" which often appears in research related to the concept of religious moderation. This shows that Indonesia is a country that is often used as the object of research - research that focuses on studying the concept of religious moderation. This is in line with the increasingly viral concept of religious moderation among academics and regulators in Indonesia since 2019, as previously explained.

Furthermore, the development of topics related to the concept of religious moderation can be visualized with the conceptual map in Figure 4, which compares several topics by looking at the density line and also the centrality line. In the Niche Themes section, which is located on the top left, it consists of the words quality of education, local wisdom, Islamic boarding school, and harmony. These topics are research topics on the concept of religious moderation which are widely studied by researchers, but have a low impact on the field of religious moderation studies by seeing that some of these topics are getting closer to the top line (density) and away from the bottom right line (Centrality).

The Emerging or Declining Themes section located at the bottom left shows that topics such as moderate Islam, radicalism and Islamic moderation are topics that are still rarely discussed by researchers and also have a low impact on the field of religious moderation studies. The third section, motor themes located at the top right, consists of the words Indonesia, Islam and interfaith dialogue, which are topics that are widely discussed by researchers and also have a significant impact on the development of the topic of religious moderation.

And then in the last section, Basic themes which are located at the bottom right consist of the topics of moderation, politics, religion, religious moderation, tolerance, and intolerance, which are topics that have study topics that are rarely discussed by researchers but have a big impact on development. field of study of the concept of religious moderation.

CONCLUSION

Through bibliometric studies in the period 2009 to 2023, it can be seen that research in the field of the concept of religious moderation has not yet developed significantly, but this does not deny that the concept of religious moderation has been integrated in many other fields. So, this indicates that research on the concept of religious moderation has the potential to continue to develop in the following years. The research results also found that several topics in the field of religious moderation such as moderate Islam, radicalism, Islamic moderation, moderation, politics, religion, religious moderation, tolerance and intolerance are some topics that are still rarely studied by researchers in the field of religious moderation so It is hoped that future researchers can develop the topics above as a scientific contribution from this research for researchers in the field of religious moderation.
REFERENCES